

Restoration Integration Panel
Protocols
9/11/97

Selection of proposals in response to the Restoration Coordination RFP will be a very competitive process, given the high volume of proposals and the amount of funds available. In consideration of this situation, the following protocols are to help facilitate development of proposal funding recommendations.

Representation

Restoration Integration Panel members were selected by the CALFED Bay-Delta Program, based upon recommendations from the Ecosystem Roundtable, BDAC and CALFED Policy Group and agency staff. Members are participating based on their technical expertise. All panel members have an equal voice and role in the selection and evaluation process. Panel members are not applicants or co-applicants on any proposal considered for funding in the 1997 Restoration Coordination funding cycle.

Members are expected to participate in all meetings scheduled for the Panel. Meetings will only be held if a simple majority (51%) of members, at a minimum, are present and if, in the staff opinion, there is balanced representation of technical expertise.

Meeting Summaries

CALFED staff shall prepare a brief summary of each meeting by identifying highlights of discussion, issues raised and decisions/recommendations. Panel members shall have the opportunity to review the summaries before they are finalized.

Confidentiality

The neutrality of the selection and evaluation process requires that proposal selection and evaluation occur in a confidential manner. Restoration Integration Panel members shall not discuss or release the specific contents of proposals to others who are not selecting and evaluating proposals. No panel member will attribute comments, evaluations, or suggestions of another panel member to non Integration Panel members. All requests for information by non panel members, including media requests, shall be directed to CALFED staff.

Integration Panel members shall take all reasonable and appropriate steps to avoid and refrain from obtaining or making available to non panel members any proposal content, scores or rankings until the CALFED Policy Group releases the scores and rankings.

Process for Making Recommendations

The Integration Panel will make proposal selection recommendations to the Ecosystem Roundtable, BDAC and CALFED Policy Group using a consensus decision-making process. For the purpose of this effort, consensus refers to the highest level of agreement that can be reached without dividing the parties into factions. The result is that every panel member supports, agrees to, or at least can live with a particular recommendation.

Panel recommendations will be made recognizing there are areas of scientific uncertainty. Panel members are asked to clearly identify areas of agreement and work hard to narrow areas of disagreement. If consensus can not be reached, the panel has several options. A panel member who is not in agreement with the recommendation may "stand aside" and not block the consensus. The dissenting member may require that a minority report detailing the differences in views be added to the final recommendation.

If a panel member who disagrees with the rest of the panel cannot "stand aside", the panel has the option to approve a recommendation based on support by at least 75% of the panel members in attendance. If the panel is inclined to use the "75% rule" option, it may delay its action to the next meeting, to allow members to reconsider their impending action. Alternatively, the panel may develop more than one recommendation and explain the reason for multiple recommendations.

Proposed Groundrules for the Meetings

- Recognize the time constraints of the meetings and phrase questions and comments as clearly and concisely as possible.
- Everyone participates and no person or interest group dominates discussion.
- Respect the views of other panel members.
- Participation is constructive; offer more than complaints.
- All panel members should strive to be positive forces in developing recommendations and resolving conflict.
- Exchange of ideas and information will be encouraged. However, to expedite discussion and ensure meetings achieve their intended objectives, participants may, at times, be asked to comment or ask questions only when called upon by the facilitator.